Tap vs. Bottled Water

Developed by Susan Hirsch
Revised by Micah Jendian

Reading Selections for this Module


Reading Rhetorically

Prereading

Getting Ready to Read

Raise your hand if you prefer drinking tap water.

Raise your hand if you prefer drinking bottled water.

Thinking Actively about the Topic and Key Concepts

Read each statement, and decide whether you believe it is true or false. Then check ✔ the box that represents your answer. (Based on http://www.storyofbottledwater.org)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>True</th>
<th>False</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Bottled water tastes better than tap water.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Bottled water is safer than tap water.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Plastic bottles are recyclable.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Activity 3

**Naming Key Concepts**

Each of the opinions in Activity 2 represents key issues important to the debate about tap vs. bottled water. List the signal words from the five statements.

Activity 4

**Clarifying Terms**

Suggest where the five “signal words” from Activity 3 should be listed in reference to social and individual values. Does each word on the list represent a social value, an individual value, an economic value, or some combination?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social</th>
<th>Individual</th>
<th>Economic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Activity 5

**Identifying Synonyms**

The author of the text uses various synonyms for the key words in the Activity 3. Complete the chart below by noting in the right column the synonym the author uses for the key word in left column.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Words</th>
<th>Synonyms Used in Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>taste</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>safer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recyclable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>convenient and easy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cheap and clean</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Be Heard! Take A Stand

Imagine that a new policy has been written that says every classroom will provide drinking water for students. Vote on the ballot below for your preference in providing water to students: tap water, bottled water dispenser, or individual bottles of water?

Voting Ballot: Mark your choice with a ✔.

The best way to supply every classroom with drinking water is to

____ A. Install a drinking fountain that uses school tap water.

____ B. Install a water dispenser (or water cooler) that uses bottled water.

____ C. Provide individual bottles of water.

Preview, Predict, and Prepare for Reading

Answer the following questions in preparation for reading “The Story of Bottled Water”:

1. “The Story of Bottled Water” could have been titled “Bottled Water.” What changes by adding the word “story” to the title?

2. The word “script” can mean handwriting, a speech, or words for a play or movie. How is “script” used here in this transcript of the video?

3. Based on the illustration, what kind of story can we predict “Bottled Water” will be?

4. Read the quote below taken from the script:

“This story is typical of what happens when you test bottled water against tap water” (4).

In this sentence, “test” is not a noun; it is a verb, and water is the object of the verb. What does it mean to test one type of water against another?

5. What do you predict the article will be about? Write down your prediction.

Understanding Key Vocabulary

Read each quote from the text. Then choose the best meaning for the bold word or words. Finally, explain in your own words the meaning of the vocabulary word or words.
1. “Is it cleaner? Sometimes, sometimes not: in many ways, bottled water is less **regulated** than tap” (5).
   a. In this excerpt, **regulated** means having a regular and uniform shape.
   b. In this excerpt, **regulated** means controlled by rules or laws.

   Explain in your own words the meaning of **regulated**:

2. “Yet people in the U.S. buy more than half a billion bottles of water every week. That’s enough to circle the globe more than 5 times. How did this come to be? Well it all goes back to how our **materials economy** works and one of its key drivers, which is known as **manufactured demand**” (8).
   a. In this quote, **materials economy** means a system of buying, selling, and managing money based on the value and use of raw materials, like oil, water, and trees.
   b. In this quote, **materials economy** means fake paper money, like in Monopoly.

   Explain in your own words the meaning of **materials economy**:

   c. In this quote, **manufactured demand** means anything that is made and then bought.
   d. In this quote **manufactured demand** means a made-up demand, made-up by or manufactured by advertisers to convince people to buy something they want, but may not really need.

   Explain in your own words the meaning of **manufactured demand**:

3. “So how do you get people to buy this **fringe product**? Simple: You manufacture demand” (11).
   a. In this quote, **fringe product** means something with a decorative tassel.
   b. In this quote, **fringe product** means something for sale that is different or unconventional.

   Explain in your own words the meaning of **fringe product**:

4. “‘When we’re done,’” one top water exec said, “‘tap water will be **relegated** to showers and washing dishes’” (13).
   a. In this quote, **relegated** means demoted or devalued.
   b. In this quote, **relegated** means to follow rules.

   Explain in your own words the meaning of **relegated**:

5. “They’re trashing the environment all along the **product’s life cycle**. Exactly how is that environmentally responsible?” (16)
a. In this quote, product’s life cycle means the time period for the life of a bottle from its production to its decomposition.
b. In this quote, product’s life cycle means the time period between when a bottle is produced and when it is purchased.

Explain in your own words the meaning of product’s life cycle:

**Activity 9**

**Making Predictions and Asking Questions**

Rewrite each of the following statements in the form of a question. Answer each with a “yes,” “no,” or “I don’t know.” What do you know or what more do you need to know in order to persuade someone else to agree with you?

1. Bottled water is safer to drink than tap water.
   
   Question:
   
   Response:

2. Water bottles can be completely recycled and safe for the environment.

   Question:

   Response:

3. Everyone can afford clean drinking water.

   Question:

   Response:

**Activity 10**

**Watching “The Story of Bottled Water”**

Now that you have watched the movie, answer the following questions which ask you to return to the predictions you made before watching the movie and to record some of your initial responses.

1. Which of your predictions turned out to be true?

2. What was surprising or interesting to you?

**Activity 11**

**Reading for Understanding, “The Story of Bottled Water”**

Read the script for “The Story of Bottled Water.”
Activity 12

Vocabulary Self-Assessment Chart

The words listed in the vocabulary self-assessment chart are important for understanding the argument inside Leonard’s movie.

Review the vocabulary from “The Story of Bottled Water,” and note how well you understand the meaning of each word or phrase by checking the appropriate column.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“The Story of Bottled Water” vocabulary (paragraph #)</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Know It Well</th>
<th>Have An Idea</th>
<th>Don’t Know It</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pristine (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>campaign (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>regulate (5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sustainable (7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>consumer demand (7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>manufactured demand (8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>designer product (10)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>relegated (13)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>environmentally responsible (15)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>product’s life cycle (16)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>landfill (19)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>downcycle (20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Understanding the Main Idea

Before more deeply analyzing or challenging the text, it is important to succinctly articulate the main idea in the text.

Write one sentence that notes the essential who, what, when, where, and why of Annie Leonard’s “The Story of Bottled Water.”

Analyzing Stylistic Choices; Annotating and Questioning the Text

Leonard wants her audience to respond a certain way and to do so uses three main rhetorical devices in her argument: 1) She tells stories to make her points more personally appealing, 2) she asks questions to engage the viewer and reader and involve them in the argument, and 3) she makes strong points that she repeats over and over throughout the article.

Complete the activities below to notice these stylistic features of Leonard’s writing and the ways she uses them to try to persuade her audience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>*</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>!</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Telling Stories</td>
<td>Asking Questions</td>
<td>Repetition of Points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Telling Stories:

Read your assigned section of “The Story of Bottled Water.”

Mark the start and end of the story in the section with an asterisk (*).

Complete the sentence:

“This section (# 1, 2, or 3) is the story of ______________________.”

Asking Questions:

1. Skim the script and write a question mark symbol for each question by the question in the margin.

2. How do you think the author wants you to answer? Yes? No? I don’t know, but tell me more? Does Leonard ever ask a question and then answer it? If you think Leonard answers one of her own questions, draw an arrow → from the question to the answer.

Repetition of Points:

Leonard addresses four main points: affordability, health, taste, and environmental responsibility, repeatedly throughout the argument.
1. You will be assigned one of the four main points:
   • Affordability
   • Health
   • Taste
   • Environmental responsibility

2. Highlight or underline text that helps to explain your assigned point. Copy the text into a graphic organizer. Find three to four quotes that help to explain the point.

3. In one to two sentences, summarize the assigned point.

**Cornell Note Style Graphic Organizer**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Point</th>
<th>Text Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Postreading**

**Activity 15**

**Summarizing the Text**

Using the summary guide below, write a summary of Leonard’s “The Story of Bottled Water” that includes her purpose for writing, her main points, the problem, and her proposed solution.

**Summary Guide for Annie Leonard’s “The Story of Bottled Water”**

**The Parts and Structure of this Guided Summary**

**Sentence One:** Name the author and title of the script and the author’s purpose for writing this story.

**Sentence Two:** Retell the beginning of the story by listing three points in the campaign for bottled water.

**Sentence Three:** State if and how the bottled water companies were successful with their ad campaign.

**Sentence Four:** State a possible problem associated with bottled water.
Sentence Five: State three points that support tap over bottled water.

Sentence Six: Construct a concluding statement presenting Annie Leonard’s point of view.

Summary Sentence Frames for “The Story of Bottled Water”

Sentence One
The central focus of ____________ ’s article, ____________ , (author’s first and last name) (title of article – in quotation marks) is about how bottled water ___________________________. (author’s purpose for writing)

Sentence Two
__________ starts by saying that if advertising companies (author’s last name) could persuade people to believe tap water __________________________, (point one)

________________________, and __________________________, (point two) (point three)

then more people would choose to drink __________________________.

Sentence Three
The ad campaign for the bottled water company was ____________ (successful or unsuccessful) because people now believe __________________________. (explain how the campaign was or was not successful)

Sentence Four
According to ____________, (author’s name) the bottled water companies may not have told the truth bottled water __________________________. (problem with bottled water)

Sentence Five
Tap water may be better than bottled water in that __________________________, (point one)

________________________, and __________________________. (point two) (point three)
Sentence Six
In conclusion, __________ believes tap water may be ___________.

(Leonard’s point of view regarding positive benefits of tap water)

Activity 16
Thinking Critically—PAT (Preliminary Analysis of Text)
“Bottled Water Matters” is a one page public press release sponsored by the bottled water industry promoting bottled water. It addresses the same issues discussed in Leonard’s “The Story of Bottled Water,” but from an opposing point of view. It presents a counterargument.

Upon first glance, what do you notice when looking at “Bottled Water Matters”?

Activity 17
Thinking Critically—The Writer’s Purpose
In your group, read your assigned section and discuss the following questions:

1. Who wrote this? What do we know about the author or writers?
2. Does the writer or do the writers seem trustworthy? Why?
3. What do the writers claim bottled water is?
4. Is the writing serious or funny? Why?
5. Does the writing make you laugh, feel sad, or experience anger? Why?

Activity 18
Assessing Believability
Reread your assigned section. Choose one of the claims about bottled water you find particularly believable. Is there a claim you find hard to believe?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section Name</th>
<th>Believable Claim</th>
<th>Hard to Believe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Using Logic, Emotion, and Expertise to Craft Powerful Statements

The Economic and Social Council of the United Nations declares the human right to clean and affordable drinking water. This text neither endorses nor opposes bottled water. Instead, it makes a case for drinking water being more than a consumer product.

In your group, examine your assigned sentence by completing the following activities:

1. Read your group’s assigned sentence from the United Nations’ introduction to “the right to water.”

2. **UnPAC** (paraphrase, annotate, connect)
   a. Paraphrase: restate the sentence using everyday words the best you can.
   b. Annotate: underline the words you think are key to understanding the sentence.
   c. Connect: What is the purpose of the sentence? Why does it matter?

3. Questions for discussion:
   a. Is this an emotional or logical statement? Why?
   b. Are there counterarguments or claims? Why?
   c. Do you agree with your assigned sentence?

Activity 20

Assessing Believability—A Staged Rehearsal

Return to the chart in Activity 18 and use your notes to add a believable and hard to believe claim for Leonard and for the United Nations’ statement on “the right to water.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Believable Claim</th>
<th>Hard to Believe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Bottled Water Matters”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The Story of Bottled Water”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Nations “right to water”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Role Play and Debate! Each of you will be assigned a role. One student is the moderator. One student represents “The Story of Bottled Water.” One student represents the bottled water industry. One student represents the United Nations. The moderator chooses a claim or hard to believe claim and gives each actor a chance to defend or attack the claim.

Reflecting on Your Reading Process
Before we move into the more formal writing component of this module, reflect on your experience reading the texts:

- In what ways have your reading and understanding of these texts improved as a result of our work with them?
- What reading strategies helped you most to deepen your understanding of the texts and the issues involved?
- How can you apply these reading strategies to other texts in other classes?

Connecting Reading to Writing
Discovering What You Think

Considering the Writing Task
Write a letter to the School Board stating and explaining your choice of drinking water.

A new school district policy has been written that says every classroom in every school will have drinking water for all students. Students voted on their drinking water preference.

Choices were
1. Drinking fountain that uses tap water
2. Water dispenser (or water cooler) that uses bottled water
3. Individual bottles of water

The votes came in, and there is a three-way tie!

The School Board asks you to write a letter stating and explaining your choice of drinking water. They will read the letters and then make their decision.

Your letter will be evaluated on these criteria:
• Your response to the topic bottled vs. tap water
• Your understanding of the topic
• Your organization and development of ideas
• Your production of a formal error-free letter

Your letter could be the difference!

Taking a Stance—What Is Most Important to You?

Below are the main issues involved in the tap vs. bottled water debate. Rank each issue 1-5, in order of importance to you.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Issues</th>
<th>Order of Importance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmentally Responsible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health and Safety</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affordability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convenience</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Preference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Taking A Stance—Quickwrite

Which do you prefer? Should the School Board provide 1) drinking fountains using tap water, 2) bottled water dispensers using bottled water, or 3) individual bottles of water?

You will have five minutes to write a response to the question and to explain your choice.

Gathering Evidence to Support Your Claims

Find quotes from the three texts to support your position and to help explain each issue.

Fill in the chart below with supportive quotes, the sources, a paraphrasing of each quote, and words that make you sound like an expert on the topic.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Issues</th>
<th>Quotes</th>
<th>Who Says It and Where?</th>
<th>In Your Own Words</th>
<th>Possible Vocabulary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Example: Environmentally Respon-</td>
<td>“Each year, making the plastic water bottles used in the U.S. takes enough oil and energy to fuel a million cars,” says Annie Leonard in “The Story of Bottled Water.”</td>
<td>¶17 Annie Leonard in “The Story of Bottled Water”</td>
<td>Leonard accuses the bottled water industry of wasting oil and energy to make plastic water bottles that could instead be used to provide gas for millions of cars a year.</td>
<td>material economy sustainable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Writing Rhetorically
Entering the Conversation

Activity 26

Composing A Draft
Select the letter-writing guide or template and begin composing a draft, referencing the prewriting work you have done in Activities 22-25.

A Letter-Writing Guide in Three Paragraphs:

Date
• Write month, day, and year

Salutation
• Begin with “Dear School Board” (Add the name of your district)
• Follow with a colon

Paragraph 1: Introduction
• State the reason for writing
• State your position

Paragraph 2: Body
• Explain two or three issues that show you understand the topic
• Consider an opposing point of view

Conclusion
• Restate your position and why it matters to you
• Leave room for a catchy phrase!

A Basic Template
Month, Day, Year

Dear (name of school district) School Board:

We appreciate your offer to supply all students with ___________. I am writing to propose that the best form of drinking water is ___________.

We appreciate your offer to supply all students with tap water. I am writing to propose that the best form of drinking water is ___________.

Dear (name of school district) School Board:

We appreciate your offer to supply all students with tap water. I am writing to propose that the best form of drinking water is bottled water.
I believe ____________________________ is better than ____________________________
because (1st reason) ____________________________
and (2nd reason) ____________________________.

According to (name and author of text) ____________________________, bottled water (Write a pro or con statement to support reason 1.) ____________________________
This matters to me because (Explain why this matters and why it is important.)______________________

In the text, (title) ____________________________ written by (author) ____________________________, bottled water or tap water (Write a pro or con statement to support reason 2.) ____________________________
This matters because (Explain why this matters and is important.)______________________

In conclusion, (choice of water) ____________________________ is the best choice. Thank you for ____________________________

In closing, (catchy slogan) ____________________________.

Sincerely,

Student Name

Activity 27

Composing a Draft—Making Your Voice Stand Out!

So that your letter ends on a strong note, try to come up with a catchy slogan which represents your choice. Even though advertising campaigns make it look easy, writing a catchy simple slogan is a difficult task. The first step to writing a clever slogan is to choose the issue you believe is most important and frame it as something that if you want it, you can have it.
Activity 28

Critiquing and Revising the Draft

Working closely with the draft you just wrote and the self-assessment guide below, identify the strengths of your draft as well as opportunities for continued improvement. Your self-assessment of the effectiveness of your letter is an important step in your revision process. At this stage, focus your attention on issues of content and purpose, rather than on mechanics.

Student Self-Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response to Topic</th>
<th>One Sentence Description of Topic</th>
<th>What am I confident I am doing well?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Student writer begins with a clear description of topic and position</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The writer addresses claims and counterarguments with relevant and creditable reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The writer persuasively concludes the letter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Support 1</th>
<th>Main Support 2</th>
<th>Main Support 3 (optional)</th>
<th>Conclusion: Why is this topic interesting, or why does it matter?</th>
<th>What vocabulary words make me sound like an expert?</th>
<th>What support do I need?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Understanding of Readings</th>
<th>One sentence listing different kinds of texts and sources:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The writer accurately states and explains the issues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The writer distinguishes between different texts and sources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Activity 29

**Editing the Draft**

Ask your partner to read your letter aloud. If your partner pauses, look to see if spelling, sentence structure, or punctuation might be the problem. Ask your partner to read as if she were a member of the School Board. Is the letter convincing? Do the same for your partner.

After editing, write a final draft of your letter.

Activity 30

**Assessing and Editing the Final Draft of the Letter**

Review your letter one last time before you consider it to be complete.

Under “Ready to Mail,” check off sections that have been completed. Under “Progressing,” write what is missing or not ready for mail.

Make any final, needed improvements.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ready to Mail</th>
<th>Progressing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Format of Letter</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date and Salutation</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening includes purpose of writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening includes position statement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding statement in closing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization and Support</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Body paragraph contains supporting reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reasons are convincingly ordered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response to Topic</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The writer demonstrates understanding of the topic and important topic issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Command of Language</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grammar, spelling, and punctuation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Activity 31

Reflecting on Your Writing Process

Now that you have completed your letter, please respond to the following questions:

What do you think are the strengths of your letter to the School Board?

What aspects of your letter, if any, could be stronger?

In your own words, what do you think this letter writing assignment intended to teach you about writing? What did you learn about the writing process from writing this letter?

Were there any stages leading up to your final letter that you found to be the most helpful and would consider using when you write future letters or papers in this or other classes? Explain.